



# UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE  
United States Patent and Trademark Office  
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS  
P.O. Box 1450  
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450  
[www.uspto.gov](http://www.uspto.gov)

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/667,253	09/19/2003	Bret Ja Chisholm	122438-1	1140
23413	7590	06/25/2004	EXAMINER	
CANTOR COLBURN, LLP 55 GRIFFIN ROAD SOUTH BLOOMFIELD, CT 06002			BOYKIN, TERRESA M	
			ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
			1711	

DATE MAILED: 06/25/2004

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

<b>Office Action Summary</b>	<b>Application No.</b>	<b>Applicant(s)</b>	
	10/667,253	CHISHOLM ET AL. <i>[Signature]</i>	
	<b>Examiner</b>	<b>Art Unit</b>	
	Terressa M. Boykin	1711	

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --  
**Period for Reply**

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If the period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days, a reply within the statutory minimum of thirty (30) days will be considered timely.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

#### Status

- 1) Responsive to communication(s) filed on 11-26-03;9-19-03.
- 2a) This action is FINAL.                    2b) This action is non-final.
- 3) Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

#### Disposition of Claims

- 4) Claim(s) 1-14 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are allowed.
- 6) Claim(s) 1-14 is/are rejected.
- 7) Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are objected to.
- 8) Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

#### Application Papers

- 9) The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) The drawing(s) filed on \_\_\_\_\_ is/are: a) accepted or b) objected to by the Examiner.  
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).  
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

#### Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

- 12) Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
  - a) All    b) Some \* c) None of:
    1. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
    2. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. \_\_\_\_\_.
    3. Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

\* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

#### Attachment(s)

1) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)	4) <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413)
2) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)	Paper No(s)/Mail Date. _____.
3) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08) Paper No(s)/Mail Date <u>11/03</u> .	5) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152)
	6) <input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____.

Art Unit: 1711

**35 USC 103**

The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

(a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negated by the manner in which the invention was made.

Claims 1, 2-12, and 13-14 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over US 20030108710 see pages 2-4, abstract, and claims; in view of WO 92/11319 .

US 20030108710 discloses a method for producing articles bearing patterned microstructures, e.g., optical film, information carrying substrates for optical recording media, etc. includes applying a radiation curable coating material to a surface of a base film substrate, passing the base film substrate and uncured coating through a compression nip defined by a nip roll and a casting drum having pattern master of the microstructures. The method further includes curing the radiation curable coating by directing radiation energy through the base film substrate from the surface opposite the surface having the coating thereon while the coating is in contact with the drum, thus causing microstructure pattern to be replicated in the cured coating layer. With regard to the percentage of by weight of polycarbonate, the reference discloses that the base film substrate is formed from a thermoplastic polycarbonate material. The thermoplastic polycarbonate resins that may be employed in producing base film substrate, include without limitation, aromatic polycarbonates, copolymers of an aromatic polycarbonate such as polyester carbonate copolymer, blends thereof, and blends thereof with other polymers depending on the end use application. In another embodiment, the thermoplastic polycarbonate resin is an aromatic homo-polycarbonate resin. They are obtained by the reaction of an aromatic dihydroxy compound with a carbonyl chloride. Other polycarbonate resins may be obtained by the reaction of an aromatic dihydroxy compound with a carbonate precursor such as a diaryl carbonate. A preferred aromatic dihydroxy compound is 2,2-bis(4-hydroxy phenyl) propane (i.e. Bisphenol-A). A polyester carbonate copolymer is obtained by the reaction of a dihydroxy phenol, a carbonate precursor and dicarboxylic acid such as terephthalic acid or isophthalic acid or a mixture of terephthalic and isophthalic acid. Optionally, an amount of a glycol may also be used as a reactant.

With regard to claims 2 and 3, note that any properties or characteristics inherent in the prior art, e.g. refractive index, although unobserved or detected by the reference,

Art Unit: 1711

would still anticipate the claimed invention. Note In re Swinehart, 169 USPQ 226. "It is elementary that the mere recitation of a newly discovered...property, inherently possessed by things in the prior art, does not cause claim drawn to those things to distinguish over the prior art".

With regard to claims 4, 5 and 9 note that the reference discloses that the base film substrate 14 formed from a thermoplastic polycarbonate material. The thermoplastic polycarbonate resins that may be employed in producing base film substrate 14, include without limitation, aromatic polycarbonates, copolymers of an aromatic polycarbonate such as polyester carbonate copolymer, blends thereof, and blends thereof with other polymers depending on the end use application. They are obtained by the reaction of an aromatic dihydroxy compound with a carbonyl chloride. Other polycarbonate resins may be obtained by the reaction of an aromatic dihydroxy compound with a carbonate precursor such as a diaryl carbonate. A preferred aromatic dihydroxy compound is 2,2-bis(4-hydroxy phenyl) propane (i.e. Bisphenol-A). A polyester carbonate copolymer is obtained by the reaction of a dihydroxy phenol, a carbonate precursor and dicarboxylic acid such as terephthalic acid or isophthalic acid or a mixture of terephthalic and isophthalic acid. Optionally, an amount of a glycol may also be used as a reactant.

With regard to claims 6 – 8 note that the reference states that the thermoplastic polycarbonate resins that may be employed in producing base film substrate 14, include without limitation, aromatic polycarbonates, copolymers of an aromatic polycarbonate such as polyester carbonate copolymer, blends thereof, and blends thereof with other polymers depending on the end use application. Also with regard to the oligomer, note that coating 18 can also include monomers having a molecular weight of from about 100 to 500, and having single unsaturation sites. Typical of these are high boiling acrylate esters, although styrene may also be used as a monomer in selected formulations. A cross-linking oligomer containing di-, tri-, or multifunctional unsaturation sites, for example, oligomeric acrylates. Suitable oligomeric acrylates include, but are not limited to urethane modified acrylate oligomers, polyester modified acrylate oligomers, epoxy modified acrylate oligomers, silicone modified acrylate oligomers, and mixtures thereof.

With regard to claims 10 and 11, note that any properties or characteristics inherent in the prior art, e.g. flammability rating, although unobserved or detected by the reference, would still anticipate the claimed invention. Note In re Swinehart, 169 USPQ 226. "It is elementary that the mere recitation of a newly discovered...property, inherently possessed by things in the prior art, does not cause claim drawn to those things to distinguish over the prior art".

With regard to claims 12 note that the reference specific states the use of optical films throughout.

Thus, US 20030108710 discloses an article comprising an optical film having a microstructure thereon wherein the film comprises the use of polycarbonate but does not

Art Unit: 1711

discloses the specific polycarbonate such as the brominated polycarbonate as disclosed herein. Nevertheless, WO 92/11319 discloses that halogenated polycarbonate, particularly brominated polycarbonate, has improved thermal stability and provides a reduced level of yellowness to optical film. Thus, it would have been obvious to one having ordinary skill in the art at the time the invention was made to employ a brominated polycarbonate in the optical film since the reference US 20030108710 states that the thermoplastic polycarbonate resins that may be employed in producing base film substrate, include without limitation, aromatic polycarbonates, copolymers of an aromatic polycarbonate such as polyester carbonate copolymer, blends thereof, and blends thereof with other polymers depending on the end use application and it is taught in WO 92/11319 that the use of brominated polycarbonate for optical film renders improved thermal stability and provides a reduced level of yellowness to optical film.

Consequently, the claimed invention cannot be deemed as novel and accordingly is unpatentable.

**Correspondence**

**Please note that the cited U.S. patents and patent application publications are available for download via the Office's PAIR. As an alternate source, all U.S. patents and patent application publications are available on the USPTO web site ([www.uspto.gov](http://www.uspto.gov)), from the Office of Public Records and from commercial sources. Applicants may be referred to the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at <http://www.uspto.gov/ebc/index.html> or 1-866-217-9197.**

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Examiner Terressa Boykin whose telephone number is 571 272-1069. The examiner can normally be reached on Monday through Friday from 6:30am to 3:00pm.

The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 703-872-9306. The general information number for listings of personnel is ( 571-272-1700).

Art Unit: 1711

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

tmb

  
Examiner Terressa Boykin  
Primary Examiner  
Art Unit 1711